

I R P A

ISTITUTO DI RICERCHE
SULLA PUBBLICA AMMINISTRAZIONE

I·I·I·J INSTITUTE FOR INTERNATIONAL LAW AND JUSTICE
NEW YORK UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

GLOBAL ADMINISTRATIVE LAW:
THE CASEBOOK

Third Edition

Edited by
Sabino Cassese
Bruno Carotti
Lorenzo Casini
Eleonora Cavalieri
Euan MacDonald

With the collaboration of
Marco Macchia
Mario Savino

2012

* * *

The Institute for Research on Public Administration (IRPA) is an Italian non profit organization, founded in 2004 by Sabino Cassese and other professors of administrative law, which promotes advanced studies and research in the fields of public law and public administration.

IRPA (<http://www.irpa.eu>)

The Institute for International Law and Justice (IILJ) brings together the research, scholarship, teaching and outreach activities of New York University School of Law's international law program.

IILJ (<http://www.iilj.org>)

IRPA–IILJ, 2012 - ISBN: 9788890758218

SUMMARY OF CONTENTS

Foreword

- I. STATES AND GLOBAL ADMINISTRATIONS IN CONTEXT
- II. GLOBAL STANDARDS
- III. GLOBAL ADMINISTRATIVE LAW PRINCIPLES
- IV. THE ENFORCEMENT OF GLOBAL DECISIONS
- V. JUDICIAL GLOBALIZATION
- VI. CONFLICTING JURISDICTIONS
- VII. GLOBAL DIMENSIONS OF DEMOCRACY
- VIII. EUROPE IN THE GLOBAL SPACE

General Bibliography

List of Abbreviations

List of Contributors

CONTENTS

Foreword

I. STATES AND GLOBAL ADMINISTRATIONS IN CONTEXT

I.1 Beyond the State: The Emergence of Global Administration
Lorenzo Casini

I.A The Notion of State and Its Discontents: Crisis or Evolution?

I.A.1 The Concept of the State in Globalization: The Case of the Environmental Cooperation Commission of the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA)
Ming-Sung Kuo

I.A.2 The Notion of “Statehood”: The Palestinian National Authority’s Attempt to Bring a Claim Against Israel Before the International Criminal Court
Yoav Meer

I.A.3 The Rise of the Global Regulatory State in the South: A Case Study on Public Utilities Regulation
Rene Urueña

I.B Formal Intergovernmental Organizations

I.B.1 Material Limits to the Power of the United Nations Security Council: Between Law and Politics
Julian Arato

I.B.2 The Reform of the UN Security Council: GA Decision 62/557
Andrea Averardi

I.B.3 International Specialized Agencies and the Question of Accountability to Beneficiaries of Aid: A Case Study of the United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF)
Elizabeth Hassan

- I.B.4 Securing ‘Orderly’ Movement of Peoples: The International Organization for Migration
J. Benton Heath
- I.B.5 The UN Committee against Torture – in Search of Greater Cooperation
Rosa Raffaelli
- I.B.6 Palestine Admission into the UNESCO: A Case of Politics, and Finances
Ilaria Paradisi
- I.B.7 The ASEAN Charter: The Legalization of ASEAN?
Michael Ewing-Chow and Leonardo Bernard
- I.B.8 The International Labour Organization: The Evolution of Soft Law
Andrew J. Ziaja
- I.B.9 The World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO)
Cinzia Carmosino
- I.B.10 SARS, the ‘Swine Flu’ Crisis and Emergency Procedures in the WHO
J. Benton Heath
- I.B.11 National Dysfunction and Global Remedies: The International Commission against Impunity in Guatemala
Emma Dunlop
- I.C Hybrid Public-Private Organizations and Private Bodies Exercising Public Functions**
- I.C.1 Legitimacy without Authority in Global Standardization Governance: The Case of the International Organization for Standardization (ISO)
Eran Shamir Borer
- I.C.2 A Hybrid Public-Private Regime: The Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN) and the Governance of the Internet
Bruno Carotti and Lorenzo Casini

- I.C.3 Hybrid Public-Private Bodies within Global Private Regimes: The World Anti-Doping Agency (WADA)
Lorenzo Casini and Giulia Mannucci
- I.C.4 The Marine Stewardship Council Sustainable Fishery Standards: Private Governance responding to Public Governance
Anastasia Telesetsky
- I.C.5 Between Vertical and Horizontal Financing: The Global Fund and the Global Aid System
Fabio Di Cristina
- I.D Intergovernmental and Transnational Networks**
- I.D.1 The G-8, the Others and Beyond
Martina Conticelli
- I.D.2 Public-Private Harmonization Networks: The Case of the International Conference on Harmonization (ICH)
Ayelet Berman
- I.D.3 ASEAN International Investment Agreements: The Incorporation of Global Regulatory Governance
Michael Ewing-Chow and Geraldine R. Fischer
- I.D.4 An Unaccountable Trans-Governmental Branch? The Basel Committee
Mario Savino and Maurizija De Bellis
- I.D.5 IOSCO: ‘Democracy’ vs. ‘Leadership’ in the Transnational Regulation of Finance?
Maurizija De Bellis
- I.D.6 Challenging Bureaucratic Inertia: The Multilateral Fund for the Implementation of the Montreal Protocol
Francesco Albisinni

I.E Complex Governance Forms: Hybrid, Multi-Level, Informal

- I.E.1 The Great East Japan Earthquake: Disasters Risk Reduction and the Policy of the International Community
Stefano Nespore
- I.E.2 Rigidity and Flexibility in the Clean Development Mechanisms
Maurizia De Bellis
- I.E.3 Lobbying and Exporting Technology in Emissions Trading: *Enel – China*
Florenzia Lebensohn
- I.E.4 The Californian “Clean Cars Law”: Global Warming and Domestic Distribution of Competences
Bruno Carotti
- I.E.5 Horizontality as a Global Strategy for Accountability: The OECD Reviewing the EU CAP
Georgios Dimitropoulos and Bruno Carotti
- I.E.6 Melting Ice and Exclusive Economic Zone
Nicola Ferri
- I.E.7 Accountability in Transnational Governance: The Case of Forestry
Gianluca Sgueo
- I.E.8 Decision-Making Procedures in Fisheries Governance: The Role of the General Fisheries Commission for the Mediterranean (GFCM)
Nicola Ferri
- I.E.9 International Organizations and Horizontal Review: The World Health Organization, the Parliamentary Council of Europe, and the H1N1 Pandemic
Abigail Deshman
- I.E.10 The TBT Agreement: Implications for Domestic Regulation
Joanna Langille
- I.E.11 Compliance and the Post-Retaliatory Phase in the WTO: *US/Canada – Continued Suspensions*
Giulio Bolaffi

- I.E.12 Multipolar Conflict: The Chinese Textile Affair
Antonella Albanesi
- I.E.13 Shared Powers: Global and National Proceedings under the International Patent Cooperation Treaty
Manuela Veronelli and Lorenzo Carbonara
- I.E.14 Mutual Recognition: The Free Movement of Professionals
Benedetto Cimino
- I.E.15 The Role of UNESCO Advisory Bodies in the World Heritage Convention
Eleonora Cavalieri

II. GLOBAL STANDARDS

II.A Global Standards as Regulatory Devices

- II.A.1 Technical Regulation and International Standards: The *EC-Trade Description of Sardines* Case
Ingo Venzke
- II.A.2 The Public Model: ICAO's Standards and Recommended Practices
Tiago Fidalgo de Freitas
- II.A.3 Regulating the Raters: Toward Convergence in the Discipline of Credit Ratings
Eleonora Cavalieri
- II.A.4 Public Accountability of a Global Private Regulator: The IFRs Foundation Ongoing Constitution Review, the IASB and the Monitoring Board
Maurizia De Bellis
- II.A.5 Competing Interests: Food Safety Standards and the Codex Alimentarius Commission
Dario Bevilacqua

II.A.6 Measuring Culture? The ICOM Standards for Museums
Cinzia Carmosino

II.A.7 The International Atomic Energy Agency (IAEA)
Andrew J. Ziaja

II.B Global Standards as Technology of Global Governance

II.B.1 Defining a New Model: Global Indicators
Emma Dunlop

II.B.2 Power, Politics, and Indicators: Exploring the Rule of Law Index
Rene Urueña

II.B.3 Labour Standards: Forced Labour in Myanmar
Elisabetta Morlino

II.B.4 The PISA Rankings: The High Cost of Low Educational Performance
Matthias Goldmann

II.B.5 Global Harmonization of Quality Standards for Pharmaceuticals
Mélanie Samson

II.B.6 Implementing Global Standards: The Case of Conformity Assessment
Georgios Dimitropoulos

III. GLOBAL ADMINISTRATIVE LAW PRINCIPLES

III.A Legality, Impartiality and Review

III.A.1 Legality: The Aarhus Convention and the Compliance Committee
Marco Macchia

III.A.2 The Aarhus Compliance Committee and the Danube River Case
Gianluca Sgueo

- III.A.3 *WTO Hormones: Impartiality and Local Interests*
Giulio Bolaffi
- III.A.4 *The Principle of Review Applied by ICSID Annulment Committees: The Argentinean Crisis and the Gas Sector*
Estefanía Ponce Durán
- III.A.5 *Global Review of National Decision: The Case Carlos Queiroz v. Autoridade Antidopagem de Portugal*
Alessandro E. Basilico
- III.A.6 *The Integrated Coastal Zone Management and Clean-Up Project: Independent Accountability Mechanisms and the Responsibility of Multilateral Development Banks*
Elena Mitzman
- III.A.7 *Corruption in Global Administrative Bodies: The Integrity Vice Presidency at the World Bank*
Siddharth Fresa
- III.B Participatory Rights**
- III.B.1 *The War on Terror and the Rule of Law: Kadi II*
Mario Savino
- III.B.2 *Sustainable Development, Environmental Impact Assessments and the Obligation to Consult: Pulp Mills on the River Uruguay*
Edouard Fromageau
- III.B.3 *A Globalized Administrative Procedure: UNHCR's Determination of Refugee Status and its Procedural Standards*
Emma Dunlop
- III.B.4 *The International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (ITLOS): The Juno Trader Case*
Diego Agus and Martina Conticelli
- III.B.5 *Supervision of National Due Process: The Tomimaru Case*
Hilde Caroli Casavola

- III.B.6 The World Bank Inspection Panel: The *Indian Mumbai Urban Transport Project* Case
Mariarita Cirmi
- III.B.7 The Vlora Thermal Power Plant in Albania: a Multiplication of Global Standards?
Mariarita Cirmi
- III.B.8 Participation of Indigenous People: The Guatemala Marlin Gold Mine
Gianluca Sgueo
- III.B.9 The Bakun Hydroelectric Project: Participatory Rights in Malaysia
Mariangela Benedetti
- III.B.10 Due Process for “Soft” Global Administrative Powers? The Case of Interpol Red Notices
Mario Savino
- III.B.11 Due Process and Fairness in the Sporting Legal Orders
Alessandro E. Basilico
- III.B.12 The Principle of Global Administrative Cooperation
Georgios Dimitropoulos
- III.B.13 GAL Principles at the Compliance Advisor/Ombudsman (CAO) of the International Finance Corporation
Ben Saper
- III.C Transparency and Duty to Give Reasons**
- III.C.1 Transparency Reform in the World Bank and Beyond
Megan Donaldson
- III.C.2 The Disclosure of Information: Anti-Dumping Duties and the WTO System
Maurizia De Bellis
- III.C.3 A Duty to Provide Reasons: *Definitive Safeguards Measures on Imports of Certain Steel Products*
Maurizia De Bellis

- III.C.4 The Organization for Prohibition of Chemical Weapons: The *Bustani* Case
Bruno Carotti

III.D Proportionality and Reasonableness

- III.D.1 Indirect Expropriation and Fair and Equitable Treatment under Investment Treaties: *Tecmed v. Mexico*
Stephan W. Schill
- III.D.2 Global Procedural and Substantial Limits for National Administrations: The *EC-Biotech* Case
Dario Bevilacqua
- III.D.3 UN Procurement
Elisabetta Morlino
- III.D.4 Reasonableness and Proportionality: The NAFTA Binational Panel and the Extension of Administrative Justice to International Relations
Marco Macchia
- III.D.5 National Regulatory Autonomy within the GATS: The *Gambling* Dispute
Maurizia De Bellis
- III.D.6 Transparency and Proportionality: Subsidies and Countervailing Measures
Sandro Mento

IV. THE ENFORCEMENT OF GLOBAL DECISIONS

- IV.1 The Domestic Implementation of International Regulatory Norms: *Department of Transportation v. Public Citizen*
Marco Macchia
- IV.2 Holding National Administrations Accountable through Peer Reviews: The FATF Case
Georgios Dimitropoulos

- IV.3 The *Metalclad* NAFTA Litigation: What is National Courts' Role in Investment Arbitration?
Filippo Fontanelli
- IV.4 When SPS Applies to Apples. The *Japan – Apples* and *Australia – Apples* WTO Disputes
Filippo Fontanelli
- IV.5 *US Boeing Subsidies*: Another Chapter in an Endless Trade Dispute
Diego Agus
- IV.6 Ensuring Global Competition: The *Airbus* Case and Launch Subsidies for Large Civil Aircraft
Giulio Bolaffi
- IV.7 Crossing Systems: EU Countermeasures against the US Byrd Amendment
Mariangela Benedetti
- IV.8 Global Bodies Reviewing National Decisions: The *Yellowstone* Case
Benedetto Cimino
- IV.9 Evaluating State's Good Faith: The *Retreaded Tires* Case
Navid Sato Rabbar

V. JUDICIAL GLOBALIZATION

- V.1 The ICC's Office of the Prosecutor and Transitional Justice: Article 53 of the Rome Statute and the Balance between Opportunity and Accountability
Rene Urueña
- V.2 The International Criminal Court and Africa, or A Story of Persecutory Delusion
Filippo Fontanelli

- V.3 The International Court of Justice and Territorial Disputes: Pedra Branca, Middle Rocks and South Ledge
Edouard Fromageau
- V.4 Special Tribunal for Lebanon: Responsibility, Justice and Global Rules
Emma Dunlop
- V.5 The African Union's Ambivalent Engagement with the International Criminal Court
Theresa Reinold
- V.6 The Impact of Human Rights Law on Supranational Regimes: The *Bosphorus* Case
Marco Pacini
- V.7 The OAS and the Inter-American Court of Human Rights: A Human Rights' Framework for the Americas
Barbara Bonafini
- V.8 Settling Global Disputes: The *Southern Bluefin Tuna* Case
Bruno Carotti and Martina Conticelli
- V.9 Spreading the WTO Dispute Resolution System: Cotton, High-Tech Products, and Developing Countries
Joanna Langille
- V.10 The Rise of International Administrative Tribunals: The *Mendaro* Affair
Mariangela Benedetti
- V.11 Administrative Tribunals and the Review of Discretionary Powers: A Case from the Council of Europe Administrative Tribunal
Elena Mitzman
- V.12 The International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes: The *Tokios Tokelès* Case
Hilde Caroli Casavola
- V.13 A "Judicial" Law-Maker: The Court of Arbitration for Sport
Giulia Mannucci

- V.14 Alternative Dispute Resolution: The ICANN's Uniform Dispute Resolution Policy (UDRP)
Bruno Carotti
- V.15 Judicial Comity: a New Way of Regulation?
Elisa D'Alterio

VI. CONFLICTING JURISDICTIONS

VI.A Conflicting Regimes: When Legal Orders Collide

- VI.A.1 The Right of Access to Information in the Age of Globalization: The Federal Administrative Court and Extraterritorial Renditions
Matthias Goldmann
- VI.A.2 Conflicts of Norms and Conflicts of Jurisdiction in the Fight against Terrorism
Marco Pacini
- VI.A.3 The Internationalization of Antitrust Policy
Lorenzo Saltari
- VI.A.4 Global Competition and Territorial Limits: The *Microsoft* Case
Tomasz Koziel
- VI.A.5 The Relationship Between Competition and Sector-Specific Regulation
Livia Lorenzoni
- VI.A.6 The Common Agricultural Policy: EU vs. WTO?
Florencia Lebensohn
- VI.A.7 European Union's Retaliatory Measures: Community Interest and Wto
Giulio Bolaffi

VI.B Conflicts before Global and National Courts

- VI.B.1 Cyclic Review? *Saipem v. Bangladesh*
Ingo Venzke
- VI.B.2 Just Political Restrictions? *Vattenfall v City of Hamburg, Moorburg Power Plant*
Isabel Feichtner
- VI.B.3 Constitutional Limits to Integration: The *Lisbon* Decision of the
BundesVerfassungsGericht, 2 BvE 2/08
Julian Arato
- VI.B.4 *Medellín v. Texas*: A “Parochial” Approach?
Elisa D’Alterio
- VI.B.5 *Bebrami/ Bebrami and Saramati v. France*: Relations between Supranational
Systems (ECHR - UN)
Elisa D’Alterio
- VI.B.6 Refugees in the European Union: *Apostolides v. Orams*
Giuseppe Martinico
- VI.B.7 The Conseil d’État and Schengen
Mariangela Benedetti
- VI.B.8 Jurisdiction over Cyberspace: YAHOO! in the French and American
Courts
Mariangela Benedetti
- VI.B.9 *Melki e Abdeli*: The Relationship between French Constitutional Review and
EU Principles
Federico Fabbrini
- VI.B.10 Legal Homogeneity v. Judicial Autonomy in the European Area
Daniele Gallo
- VI.B.11 The Italian Expropriation Case: Incorporating the ECHR into National
Legal Orders
Marco Pacini

- VI.B.12 The Italian Constitutional Court, the ECHR, and the Enactment of an “Interpretative Act”
Federico Fabbrini

VII. GLOBAL DIMENSIONS OF DEMOCRACY

VII.A Promoting Democracy and Human Rights Globally

- VII.A.1 Explaining the Globalization of Democracy: Democracy and the Diffusion of Markets
Ingo Venzke
- VII.A.2 The EU’s Enlargement Policy and the Promotion of Democracy: The Case of Turkey
Valentina Volpe
- VII.A.3 Who Promotes Democracy? The United Nations Democracy Fund and the European Instrument for Democracy and Human Rights: Causality or Convergence?
Bruno Carotti
- VII.A.4 The OAS: Legalizing Norms of Democracy
Giacomo Delledonne
- VII.A.5 Foreign Aid and Democratization: The Case of Zambia
Giulia Bertezzo
- VII.A.6 Guaranteeing Electoral Democratic Standards: The Venice Commission and “The Code of Good Practice in Electoral Matters”
Valentina Volpe
- VII.A.7 Democracy and Human Rights: Reciprocally Fostering and/or Restraining Concepts?
Marco Pacini

- VII.A.8 UN Transitional Administrations: Kosovo, East Timor and Iraq
Elisabetta Morlino
- VII.A.9 *Chad - Petroleum Development and Pipeline Project*: Human Rights and the World Bank
Mariarita Circi
- VII.A.10 Thinking Human Rights Globally: The *Ken Saro Wiwa* Case
Emanuela Cocco
- VII.A.11 Social Economic Human Rights, National Constitutions and National Courts: The *Mazibuko* Case
Mariarita Circi
- VII.A.12 Democratization by International Organizations: The Case of EU and Romania
Elisabetta Morlino
- VII.B Civil Society and Multinational Corporations**
- VII.B.1 The United Nations Global Compact
Yoav Meer
- VII.B.2 OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises: The *Aker Kvaerner* Case – Corporate Social Responsibility and Human Rights at Guantanamo Bay
Matthias Goldmann
- VII.B.3 The Equator Principles: Voluntary Standards in Project Financing
Yoav Meer
- VII.B.4 Does Civil Society Promote Democracy? The Arab Spring and the EU’s “New Response to a Changing Neighbourhood”
Valentina Volpe
- VII.C Media**
- VII.C.1 WikiLeaks, Global Security and Democratic Control
Edoardo Chiti

- VII.C.2 The *Google-China* Case
Bruno Carotti
- VII.C.3 *Google Books*: Copyright Law or Public Interest?
Bruno Carotti
- VII.C.4 The *Google – Vivi Down* Case: Providers’ Responsibility, Privacy and Internet Freedom
Bruno Carotti
- VII.C.5 Global Interactions: SpotCloud, a Market for Computing Power
Tomasz Koziel
- VII.D Global Security**
- VII.D.1 The Regulation of Global Security Operations: The Case of the European Union’s *Operation Artemis*
Edoardo Chiti
- VII.D.2 Unilateral and Universalist Pressures, and the Limits of Global Security: The United Nations, the Occupying Countries, and the Reconstruction of Iraq
Edoardo Chiti
- VII.D.3 Responsibility to Protect, Military Intervention and Assistance in Rebuilding: The UN and the Libyan Crisis
Edoardo Chiti
- VII.D.4 The Composite Regulation of Global Security Operations: The Case of the European Union’s *Operation Atalanta*
Edoardo Chiti
- VII.D.5 Human Rights and Terrorism: the Use of Passenger Name Records
Maria Tzanou
- VII.D.6 Privacy and EU Counter-Terrorism Policy (European Data Protection Supervisor Opinion no. 2011/C 56/02)
Patrizio Rubechini

- VII.D.7 The Use of Financial Data to Fight Terrorism: The SWIFT Case
Maria Tzanou
- VII.D.8 An Indirect Challenge to the Security Council: *Abdelrazik v. Canada (Minister of Foreign Affairs)*
Abigail C. Deshman
- VIII. EUROPE IN THE GLOBAL SPACE**
- VIII.1 Relations between Global Law and EU Law
Elisa D'Alterio
- VIII.2 The EU on the Global Stage after the Lisbon Treaty: External Action and the External Action Service
Joris Larik
- VIII.3 The Comitology Reform. A New Role under the Lisbon Treaty?
Mario Savino
- VIII.4 The Interactions between EU and Global Administrative Law: The EU Eco-Management and Audit Scheme (EMAS) and its Relations with Global Environmental Management Systems
Edoardo Chiti
- VIII.5 *Mox Plant* – The European Court of Justice and International Agreements
Filippo Fontanelli
- VIII.6 European Union and Financial Crisis: The European System of Financial Supervision
Alessandro E. Basilio
- VIII.7 Coping with Harmonization in Times of Crisis: The EU and the IFRS
Maurizia De Bellis
- VIII.8 Public Services in Europe: The *Kattner* Case
Giacomo Delledonne

- VIII.9 Public Services and Transboundary Cooperation (Regulation no. 1082/2006)
Giacomo Delledonne
- VIII.10 Making Administrations Work: Digitalizing Public Services in Europe
Giacomo Delledonne
- VIII.11 The EU Data Protection Directive as a Model for Global Regimes
Maria Tzanou
- VIII.12 The Second Generation Schengen Information System (SIS II) and Human Rights
Maria Tzanou
- VIII.13 Balancing of Interests, Scientific Cognitions Knowledge and Health: The *Gowan* Case
Simone Penasa
- VIII.14 European Administrative Cooperation: The Strategy for Expansion of IMI
Lorenzo Carbonara
- VIII.15 The Relationship Between the Italian Constitutional Court and the ECJ: The Preliminary Reference in C. Cost. Order 103/2008
Giuseppe Martinico
- VIII.16 Regional Policy for Global Issues: The European Pact on Immigration and Asylum
Simone Penasa and Claudia Pretto
- VIII.17 The Relationship between the ECHR and EU Law, the Presumption of Equivalent Protection Revisited and the End of Mutual Trust in the EU Asylum System
Daniele Gallo

General Bibliography

List of Abbreviations

List of Contributors